Debate with Grand Ayatollah Montazeri Part 4

Safiyah

Question No. 3

The Prophet attacked Kheibar, enslaved Safiyah and raped her in the same day that he killed her husband, father and many of her relatives. Is this how a messenger of God should behave?

Ayatollah Montazeri,

As for the Question concerning Safiyah, it is important to pay attention to the following points.

1- Safiyah was the daughter of Huyah ibn Akhtab the chief of the tribe of Bani Nadir. She had lost her father in the battle of Kheibar and her husband had been killed before the peace treaty. The hostages in those days had very hard and dire life. For this reason according to the recommendation of the prophet (pbuh) the women of the idolaters who were captured in war either married Muslim men who were previously married to other women or became their slaves maids to ascertain their own survival. Polygyny in those days was customary and was the best way for the protection of the women who had not husbands-let alone the women who were hostages.

Sina

Dear Ayatollah Ozma Montazeri,

It is true that Safiyah had lost both her father and her husband and many of her relatives, but you forgot to mention that she lost her loved ones because the Prophet killed them Killing men and stealing their women was the tradition of the cavemen. One would expect that the Prophet of God would not perpetuate the barbaric traits of the cavemen but rather set a new standard of ethical and moral conduct.

You make it sound as if the Prophet was doing these women a favor by marrying them and saving them from their miseries but forget to mentions that it was him who put them in this dire situation in the first place. These women were not hostages before Muhammad raided their towns, killed their loved ones and enslaved them.

What the Prophet did was what the bandits and the brigand used to do in the old days. One must be completely screwed up with his values to see any goodness in this utterly shameful

and barbaric act of the Prophet. Killing men and possessing their women were acts of savagery. There is not a single good in such a heinous deed.

If as you say the Prophet wanted to save these poor women from very hardship that they were facing why he did not marry the older women? Why he picked the prettiest of all? Safiyah was chosen because of her looks. Here is the Hadith.

Narrated 'Abdul 'Aziz:
Anas said, 'When Allah's Apostle invaded Khaibar, we offered the Fajr prayer there yearly in the morning) when it was still dark. The Prophet rode and Abu Talha rode too and I was riding behind Abu Talha. The Prophet passed through the lane of Khaibar quickly and my knee was touching the thigh of the Prophet . He uncovered his thigh and I saw the whiteness of the thigh of the Prophet. When he entered the town, he said, 'Allahu Akbar! Khaibar is ruined. Whenever we approach near a nation then evil will be the morning of those who have been warned.' He repeated this thrice. The people came out for their jobs and some of them said, 'Muhammad (has come).' (Some of our companions added, "With his army.") We conquered Khaibar, took the captives, and the booty was collected. Dihya came and said, 'O Allah's Prophet! Give me a slave girl from the captives.' The Prophet said, 'Go and take any slave girl.' He took Safiya bint Huyai. A man came to the Prophet and said, 'O Allah's Apostles! You gave Safiya bint Huyai to Dihya and she is the chief mistress of the tribes of Quraiza and An-Nadir and she befits none but you.' So the Prophet said, 'Bring him along with her.' So Dihya came with her and when the Prophet saw her, he said to Dihya, 'Take any slave girl other than her from the captives.' Anas added: The Prophet then manumitted her and married her."

Thabit asked Anas, "O Abu Hamza! What did the Prophet pay her (as Mahr)?" He said, "Her self was her Mahr for he manumitted her and then married her." Anas added, "While on the way, Um Sulaim dressed her for marriage (ceremony) and at night she sent her as a bride to the Prophet . (Sahih Bukhari 1.367)

From the above Hadith we learn that the raid of Khaibar was a bolt from the blue. The people of the town were not warned and were not prepared for this foray. It was typical of the Prophet not to let his victims to defend themselves. He would attack them dishonorably with no warning. In fact the name Quzvah means nothing but “sudden attack”. Khaibar broke no treaty with the Prophet; there was not any sign that they would endanger the Muslims. The only reason that the Prophet invaded that town, killed whoever stood in his way and took the pretty women as sex-slaves was that he needed their wealth.

The holy Prophet did not stop at that, he even forced those elderly men and women whom he did not kill and did not take as sex slaves to toll the land and give him 50% of the proceeds. Any person with a grain of fairness would know that this is not justice. What the Prophet did was unholy and satanic.

Ayatollah Montazeri,

2- After Safiyah became a hostage, there were a few people who wanted to marry her. But since she was the daughter of the chief of the tribe, the Prophet in consideration of he social status, did not allow others to marry her. Safiyah herself was reluctant to marry ordinary people. Therefore the Prophet (pbuh) for the sake of protecting Safiyah, accepted to marry her. The Prophet gave Safiyah the choice to return to her relatives or stay in Medina and embrace Islam. And told her that if she wanted to remain a Jew he would not impose Islam on her. Safiyah chose the latter. The historians agree that being a wife of the Prophet was a great privilege and was regarded with high esteem. The Holy Quran (Ahzab:6) calls the wives of the Prophet as “Mother of the Believers”

Sina

As for the Safiyah, it is evident that the Prophet took her for one reason only that was because she was a beautiful woman. Muhammad took it away from Dahya after seeing her. It had nothing to do with the position of her father. If the Prophet had any regards for her father and his position he would not have slew him. The truth is manifest as the sun. You are free to close your eyes and deny it.

You said that the Prophet gave Safiyah the choice to join her people or follow her. The Prophet killed her father, her husband and many of her relatives. Those who were left were to work the land and pay 50% of their income to the Prophet as Jazyeh. Even then the Prophet changed his mind in a short period of time and expelled all the Jews from Khaibar. So the choice you are talking about was not much of a choice. It was the choice between pleasing sexually an old fetid man who was the murderer of her loved ones or joining a bunch of old men and women who were neither warriors nor young enough to serve as sex slaves to the followers of the Prophet. In the first case she had the chance to live but if she joined her people her fate was uncertain, she had to work in the fields and pay half of the proceeds to Muhammad (pbuh). There is not much choice here.

Being a wife of the Prophet may have had its prestige. However, I believe it is much preferable to live with one’s loved ones than with their murderer; even if that murderer is the Prophet of Allah.

Ayatollah Montazeri,

3- If the Messenger of Allah –God forbid- was a lustful man he would not married a 40-year-old woman in his youth when he had the chance to marry with the best of girls of the noble tribes of Arabs. On the other hand, people who are lustful are also inclined towards luxuries and gluttony and are attracted towards other pleasures and gratification that life can offer. While as history has recorded the Prophet and his wives had a very modest and low in accordance to their own time, to the extent that his wives complained and put the Prophet under the pressure. In this connection the Ahzab 28,29 was revealed and gave his wives the choice to stay with the Prophet and endure the poverty or divorce and go for the comfortable life of the world.

Sina

The messenger of Allah WAS a lustful man. But when he was young he was poor and no one paid much attention to him. No young girl with noble linage would have married a pauper like Muhammad who was running after the Camels of another woman. The Prophet had no chance to marry a beautiful young woman. Kadijah with her wealth and power was a boon to the Prophet that changed his life completely. The true nature of the Prophet became evident when Khadijah died and he became powerful by raiding the merchant Caravans. It was then that he started to amass wealth and women.

Muhammad was not a wealthy man when he immigrated to Medina. Khadijah must have lost most of her possessions during the three hard years when the Meccan boycotted the Prophet and his family to retaliate against his continuous taunting of their deities. His first year in Medina was very hard. He had very little money to live on. His robbery attempts at several merchant caravans were all aborted. It was only at Nakhlah that by treachery he could steal the caravan and enrich himself with the booty. It took him several more of these forays and the genocide of the Jews and the confiscation of their properties to amass a lot of wealth.

*And He made you heirs of their lands, their houses, and their goods, and of a land which ye had not frequented (before). And Allah has power over all things. (*Q.33: 27)

But the Prophet had very little regards for his wives and would not give them what they wanted. That is why when they complained he threatened to divorce them and it is true that at one time Muhammad's wives complained because he would not give them enough of the wealth that he used to steal from the un-believers. It is in continuation of the above verse that the Prophet makes his Alah says

O Prophet! Say to thy Consorts: "If it be that ye desire the life of this World, and its glitter,- then come! I will provide for your enjoyment and set you free in a handsome manner.(Q.33: 28)
But if ye seek Allah and His Messenger, and the Home of the Hereafter, verily Allah has prepared for the well-doers amongst you a great reward.(Q.33: 29)

The Prophet was a master manipulator and knew how to control his wives and make obey him and be at his service.

*O Consorts of the Prophet! If any of you were guilty of evident unseemly conduct, the Punishment would be doubled to her, and that is easy for Allah.(*Q.33: 30) *But any of you that is devout in the service of Allah and His Messenger, and works righteousness,- to her shall We grant her reward twice: and We have prepared for her a generous Sustenance. (*Q.33: 31)